

# Rubrics for Assessing Career and Technical Education Programs

Minnesota Department of Education  
Adult and Career Education

# Introduction

## Background

Minnesota Rule 3505.1100 requires school districts to receive state approval for their secondary career and technical (vocational) education programs using a process and standards established by the Commissioner. In 2003, the Minnesota Department of Education instituted a process under which districts submitted information for approval or pre-approval their career and technical education programs. The Department also established a geographic cycle for districts to resubmit their programs on a five-year basis.

Minnesota Rule 3505.1100 also specifies that program approval will be contingent upon a district's demonstration that minimum standards are met. The Department has been working this year to clarify these program standards, and has developed these rubrics that describe not only benchmarks to meet minimum standards, but also benchmarks for emerging, quality, and exemplary standards. These rubrics have been established in each of the following seven sections: Community Involvement, Personnel, Program Administration, Program Assessment, Program Design, Program Resources, and Support Services.

Intended Use – *(Description in progress)*

Program Approval Process

Program Self-Assessment

## Program Assessment and Rubrics

Assessment is the systematic and ongoing method of gathering, analyzing and using information from measured outcomes to improve student learning.

### Purpose of Program Assessment

1. To improve – the assessment process should provide feedback to determine how the program can be improved.
2. To inform – the assessment process should inform school board, administration, staff, and community of the contributions and impact of the program.
3. To prove – the assessment process should encapsulate and demonstrate to others what the program is accomplishing.
4. To support – the assessment process should provide support for CTE decision-making activities.

### Characteristics of Effective Program Assessment

Effective program assessment should answer these questions:

1. What are you trying to do?
2. How well are you doing it?
3. Using the answers to the first two questions, how can you improve what you are doing?
4. What and how does a program contribute to the development and growth of its students?
5. How can student learning be improved?

### Using Rubrics to Assess Program Effectiveness

Rubrics can be used to provide formative feedback to assess program effectiveness. They represent a clear format for classifying specific behaviors or products that vary along a continuum. A well-designed rubric should be an efficient method to focus on specific factors to determine the current level of program effectiveness and suggest areas of focus to on for program improvement.

### Rubrics for Assessing Career and Technical Education Programs

The CTE Rubrics are organized into seven sections. The far left column in each section is the broad category. The scale across the top is the level of performance and is labeled minimal, emerging, quality, and exemplary. Each level of performance has descriptors that translate the level into examples reflecting that level. The level of performance builds upon the previous level with minimal the lowest and exemplary the highest level.

#### SECTION:

	Minimal	Emerging	Quality	Exemplary
Category	Descriptor	Descriptor	Descriptor	Descriptor

## CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION PROGRAM QUALITY ASSESSMENT SECTIONS

1. COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT
2. PERSONNEL
3. PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION
4. PROGRAM ASSESSMENT
5. PROGRAM DESIGN
6. RESOURCES
7. SUPPORT SERVICES

## Supporting Evidence for Measuring Assessment

### Section 1. COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT

- A. Advisory Committee membership roster with sector representation
- B. Annual program of work
- C. Meeting agendas
- D. Record of minutes on file
- E. Community needs assessment
- F. Advisory committee plan of action
- G. Documentation of guest speakers, career days, field trips

### Section 2. PERSONNEL

- A. Documentation of certification on file at district level
- B. Documentation of industry certification
- C. Portfolio of coursework
- D. Written professional development plan
- E. Documentation of participation in professional development activities
- F. Documentation of membership or participation in professional groups(s), e.g. externships, union groups, industry or occupational organizations.
- G. Paraprofessional/Technical Tutor – documentation of meeting NCLB professional requirements for paraprofessionals or Technical Tutor license.

### Section 3. PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION

- A. Budget
- B. Financial – UFARS on file at local and state level

### Section 4. PROGRAM ASSESSMENT

- A. District's annual performance report
- B. Student enrollment and projections
- C. Collection of data information
- D. Follow-up survey of CTE program participants after graduation
- E. Program approval on file with the Minnesota Department of Education
- F. Documentation of community input
- G. Collection of student feedback

## Section 5. PROGRAM DESIGN

- A. Documentation of career development competencies and activities within the curriculum
- B. Career Cluster and career pathway information (brochures, videos, software)
- C. Documentation of local curriculum alignment
- D. Local standards on file
- E. Documentation of articulation agreements, concurrent enrollment, college in the schools.
- F. Syllabi and lesson plans available.
- G. Examples of student assessments and projects.
- H. Student portfolios e.g. photo display, awards, certificates of recognition.
- I. Student organizations – affiliation forms with membership lists, chapter program of work, news paper clipping, awards program, program of work, and membership recruitment materials
- J. Records of students participating in work-based learning experiences.

## Section 6. RESOURCES

- A. Review of program/course materials - Compare materials to curricula and class roster
- B. Inventory and budgetary plan with proposed schedule of replacement priorities
- C. Resource materials inventory
- D. Equipment inventory
- E. Records of expenditures, receipts, and account balances
- F. Records of maintenance

## Section 7. SUPPORT SERVICES

- A. Documentation of class offerings through master schedule, student handbook, program brochure, publications, enrollment data
- B. Teacher/paraprofessional/special education student ratio in classroom
- C. List of accommodations and modifications
- D. Student placement or scheduling process
- E. Student performance level assessment results
- F. Statement of non-discriminatory protocol
- G. Review by advisory committee

Rubrics for Assessing Career and Technical Education Programs  
CROSSWALK with Career and Technical Education (CTE)  
Standards and Measures and Program Approval Assurance Statements

Section 1. COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT:

- CTE Program STANDARD 2: Local Educational Agency (LEA) involves volunteer community partnerships in an advisory capacity to assist in planning, implementation, and evaluation of programs.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 1: Program Planning involved a local multi-sector partnership or a local CTE volunteer community partnership in an advisory capacity.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 2: The multi-sector partnership or local CTE volunteer community partnership will continue to provide ongoing assistance in the development, evaluation, and updating of the curricula.

Section 2. PERSONNEL:

- CTE Program STANDARD 8: LEA will use appropriately licensed teachers that have met the Minnesota Board of Teaching licensure requirements to teach Career and Technical Education Programs and will have an approved Career and Technical Program Proposal on file with the Minnesota Department of Education.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 10: An appropriately licensed career and technical education instructor will teach the program. (Form ED-02335-02) or for Youth with Disabilities: Coordination of the program must be done by 1) person who holds a valid Work Experience Coordinator-Handicapped License or 2) person who holds both a valid Teacher Coordinator of Work-Based Learning and a Special Education Teacher License. (Form ED-00381-14)

Section 3. PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION:

- CTE Program STANDARD 9: LEA will assess the degree of implementation of Standards 1-8.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 12: Annually, districts will assess programs and maintain data against CTE Program Approval Assurance Statements.

Section 4. PROGRAM ASSESSMENT:

- CTE Program STANDARD 8: LEA will use appropriately licensed teachers that have met the Minnesota Board of Teaching licensure requirements to teach Career and Technical Education Programs and will have an approved Career and Technical Program Proposal on file with the Minnesota Department of Education.
- Program Approval Assurance Statement 11: Upon request, the LEA shall supply program data necessary for program management, improvement, evaluation, and federal/state reporting.

Section 5. PROGRAM DESIGN:

- CTE Program STANDARD 1: LEA provides learners with opportunities to gain employability and career skills.
- CTE Program STANDARD 3: Learners have the opportunity to develop long-range academic and post high school plans and personal portfolios.

- CTE Program STANDARD 4: LEA supports the development of CTE curricula and teaching/learning techniques derived from knowledge and skill standards that reflect current business, industry and labor standards and trends, promising/emerging practices and the use of current technology.
- CTE Program STANDARD 6: LEA supports a coordinated program of school-, work-, and service-based learning opportunities including connecting activities and CTE Student Organizations.
- CTE Program STANDARD 8: LEA will use appropriately licensed teachers that have met the Minnesota Board of Teaching licensure requirements to teach Career and Technical Education Programs and will have an approved Career and Technical Program Proposal on file with the Minnesota Department of Education.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 3: The program provides learners with options for school-based learning.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 4: The program provides learners with options for school-based learning with a work-based/Co-op component including connecting activities/CTE student organizations.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 5: The curriculum is designed to achieve the curriculum standards and measures for the particular program area.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 6: The program will maintain class size conducive to efficient teaching and learning, and not exceed the number that the space and equipment will accommodate effectively and safely.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 8: The program will comply with all federal and state laws, rules and policies governing school-based and/or work-based educational programs.

#### Section 6. RESOURCES:

- CTE Program STANDARD 4: LEA supports the development of CTE curricula and teaching/learning techniques derived from knowledge and skill standards that reflect current business, industry and labor standards and trends, promising/emerging practices and the use of current technology.
- CTE Program STANDARD 5: LEA will develop and maintain teaching/learning environments that will maximize learning for students selecting curricula in CTE programs.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 6: The program will maintain class size conducive to efficient teaching and learning, and not exceed the number which the space and equipment will accommodate effectively and safely.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 7: Current business/industry equipment will be used in all areas of instruction. Equipment may be located in schools, business/industry, or in the community.

#### Section 7. SUPPORT SERVICES:

- CTE Program STANDARD 7: LEA will provide equal access and necessary support to diverse and special populations to ensure participation in all components of career and technical education.
- CTE Program STANDARD 3: Learners have the opportunity to develop long-range academic and post high school plans and personal portfolios.
- CTE Program Approval Assurance Statement 9: The program is designed to be sensitive to needs of a diverse population providing the support needed by the learner.



## Bibliography

- Clark, Aaron C. and Wenig, Robert E., "Identification of Quality Characteristics for Technology Education Programs: A North Carolina Case Study," *Journal of Technology Education*, Vol. 11 No. 1, Fall 1999, pages 18-26.
- Kerka, Sandra, "Effective Advisory Committees In Brief: Fast Facts for Policy and Practice No. 17, Nation Dissemination Center National Research Center, 2002, <http://www.nccte.org/publications/inBriefs.asp>
- "Quality Review Measures for Career and Technology Education," South Carolina Department of Education, <http://www.myschools.com/offices/cate/QualityReviewMeasures.html>
- "Rubrics for Scoring 2005 Exemplary Career Technical Education Applications", California Department of Education, California School Recognition Program, [www.cde.ca.gov/ta/sr/cs/documents/rubriccte05r.pdf](http://www.cde.ca.gov/ta/sr/cs/documents/rubriccte05r.pdf)
- "Secondary Self-Assessment," Career and Technical Education Standards and Measures, Revised January 2004, Minnesota Department of Education, Adult and Career Education
- "Secondary Program Review Essential Components Rubrics," 9/2004, Idaho Division of Professional-Technical Education, [www.pte.state.id.us/document/doc/PRRubrics.doc](http://www.pte.state.id.us/document/doc/PRRubrics.doc)
- "Utah Career and Technical Education Program Approval Standards," Utah State Office of Education, Utah Applied Technology Education, <http://www.schools.utah.gov/ate/Program%20Approval/program%20approval.htm>
- "What Makes a Career-Technical Education Program Exemplary? A Rubric for Secondary-Level Programs," National Dissemination Center for Career and Technical Education, The Ohio State University, 2002, [www.ade.az.gov/cte/api/ExemplaryProgramRubric.pdf](http://www.ade.az.gov/cte/api/ExemplaryProgramRubric.pdf)
- "2005-2006 Program Improvement Instrument," South Dakota Department of Education, Office of Career and Technical Education, [doe.sd.gov/octe/pip/docs/Secondary%20Instrument05-06.pdf](http://doe.sd.gov/octe/pip/docs/Secondary%20Instrument05-06.pdf)

## Minnesota Statutes

- 120B.11 School district process for reviewing curriculum, instruction, and student achievement.
- 124D.454 Access to Minnesota's transition system for children with a disability.
- 124D.46 Education and employment transitions system
- 124D.47 Comprehensive youth apprenticeship program.
- 124D.49 Education and employment transitions partnerships
- 124D.50 Service-learning and work-based learning curriculum and programs.

## Minnesota Rules

3505.1100 Standards for Program Approval` ``  
3505.1300 Evaluation by State Board for Vocational Education  
3505.1400 Local Advisory Committee  
3505.1800 ANNUAL REPORTS.  
3505.2300 Student Eligibility for programs.  
3505.2400 Scope  
3505.2500 Instructional Program Approval  
3505.4300 Community-Based Education  
3505.4900 SUPPORT SERVICES.  
3505.5900 Student Eligibility  
5200.0930 Exceptions to Prohibitions Related to Employment of Minors.  
8710.8000 Core Skills for Teachers of Career and Technical Education.